

CCWG-Accountability (WP1): Draft Content for the Second Public Comment Report

5.5 Power: Removing Individual ICANN Directors

- 01 The Board is the governing body of ICANN, with main responsibilities that include employing the President and CEO, appointing the Officers, overseeing organizational policies, making decisions on key issues, defining the organization's strategic and operating plans and holding the staff to account for implementing them.
- 02 Of ICANN's sixteen Directors, fifteen are appointed for a fixed term (3 years) and generally are in office for the whole term that they are appointed for by their SO/AC, or by the Nominating Committee. In addition the Board appoints the President and CEO (confirmed each year at the AGM), who serves on the Board *ex officio* (by reason of his or her position as President and CEO). The power to remove individual directors of the ICANN Board is currently available only to the Board itself, and can be exercised through a 75% vote of the Board. There is no limitation¹ on the Board's power to remove a director specified in the Bylaws.
- 03 This power would allow for the removal of a director before his or her fixed term comes to an end, with no rules set as to limitations on such removal or requirements for a particular cause for such removal. It is expected that this power would only be exercised in cases of serious difficulty with a particular director.
- 04 For the seven directors appointed by one of the three Supporting Organizations or by the At-Large Community (or by subdivisions within them, e.g. within the GNSO), a process led by that organization or subdivision would decide on the director's removal. Only the SO or AC that appointed the director could decide on that director's removal.
- 05 For directors appointed by the Nominating Committee, a process of the SOs and ACs participating in the Community Mechanism as Sole Member would make a decision on the director's removal by voting as detailed below. Any SO or AC would be able to petition for the removal of a director appointed by the Nominating Committee.
- 06 The following common elements apply if the director was appointed by the Nominating Committee:

01 _____
02
03
04
05

¹ There are escalation paths, up to and including removal from the Board, for Board member violations of the Code of Conduct and Conflict of Interest Policies, but the Bylaws do not currently require such a violation to occur prior to Board removal.

- a. A petition to start consideration of a director's removal requires a **simple majority** in one SO or AC.
- b. Where a petition to remove a director meets the required threshold, a meeting of the ICANN Community Assembly (ICA) will be convened. At that meeting:
 - i. the Chair of the ICA must not be associated with the petitioning SO/AC or with the director involved;
 - ii. representatives of the petitioning SO/AC must explain why they seek the director's removal;
 - iii. the director has the opportunity to reply and set out his or her views; and
 - iv. questions and answers can be asked of the petitioning SO/AC and of the director involved by all the other participants in the ICA
- c. Between 7 and 14 days after the meeting of the ICA, the Community Mechanism as Sole Member, through votes of participating SOs and ACs, makes a decision as to whether the director is removed or not.
- d. The threshold to cause the removal of the director is **3/4** of the votes cast, with a minimum participation of **3/5** of eligible votes.

07 The decision to remove the director, where made by the appointing SO and AC, is implemented by the CMSM in a procedure to be set out in the Bylaws that involves a similar pass-through to that which will occur to implement the appointment of directors. Where the decision is made by votes through the CMSM process, the Sole Member will be bound by the vote outcome.

08 Where a director who had been appointed by an SO/AC is removed, that SO/AC is responsible for filling the vacancy through the usual process. SOs or ACs may choose to develop expedited processes for use in such a situation, and suggest these to the ICANN Board for consideration of the relevant Bylaw changes.

09 Where a director who has been appointed by the Nominating Committee is removed, the Nominating Committee may appoint a new director. It is expected that the Nominating Committee will amend its procedures so as to have two or three "reserve" candidates in place, should any or all of its directors be removed under this power (or as part of the recall of the entire ICANN Board described in 5.6).

10 In all cases, directors appointed to replace directors removed by this power fill the same "seat" and their term will come to an end when the term of the director they are replacing would have done.

11 As part of Work Stream 2, the CCWG-Accountability is recommending the development of community standards that will guide Board members, SOs, and ACs regarding expected behavior of directors, and the expectations which if not met could be expected to lead to a petition for their removal. Such standards would help establish common expectations across the community – they would **not** be criteria for, nor limitations on, the exercise of this power, or give any grounds for a director subject to removal to appeal or challenge the decision. The development of such standards should be a matter of priority in Work Stream 2.

Votes Cast	>66%	75%	>75%
1	1	1	1
2	2	2	2
3	2	3	3
4	3	3	4
5	4	4	4
6	4	5	5
7	5	6	6
8	6	6	7
9	6	7	7
10	7	8	8
11	8	9	9
12	8	9	10
13	9	10	10
14	10	11	11
15	10	12	12
16	11	12	13
17	12	13	13
18	12	14	14
19	13	15	15
20	14	15	16