**Multi-lingual recommendation 19 and 22**

The ATRT1 report had focus on language as a potential barrier to the community in the sense that if all documents are in English only, there is a risk that many of the non-native English speakers might have difficulties with comprehending important issues and missing out important information. Furthermore it was recommended that the senior staff was multi-lingual too in order to deliver optimal levels of transparency and accountability to the community.

In 2012 ICANN introduced translation services to enable a better service to the larger diverse community. Though the language services are welcome the quality of the translation is terms of accuracy to the working language of the various communities are important. In addition, the timeliness of the translation in relation to community interaction and participation is necessary. This will ensure effective and clear communication with the community.

1. **Analysis of previous review teams recommendations**

* **Recommendation 19 and 22**  
    
  19. Within 21 days of taking a decision, the ICANN Board should publish its translations (including the required rationale as outlined in other ATRT recommendations) in the languages called for in the ICANN Translation Policy.  
    
  22. The Board should ensure that ICANN’s senior staffing arrangements are appropriately multi-lingual, delivering optimal levels of transparency and accountability to the community.
* **Summary of ICANN’s assessment of implementation including actions taken, implementability and effectiveness**

**Recommendation 19**

The Board meeting on 18 October 2012 passed resolution number 2012.10.18.02 minutes/resolution <http://www.icann.org/en/groups/board/documents/resolutions-18oct12-en.htm#1.b>

Staff has provided input during the call with ATRT2 team on Thursday, 20 June 2013 – 16:00 UTC explaining how the translations services works and the challenges they experience. The details of the discussion are available on the following links:

[Recording - 20 June](http://audio.icann.org/atrt2-20130620-en.mp3)

### [Transcript - 20 June](https://community.icann.org/download/attachments/41890059/20130620_ATRT2_ID795926.pdf?version=1&modificationDate=1372186140000)

Wednesday, July 17, 2013 3:00PM in Durban Meeting between Carlos Raúl Gutierrez of work stream 4 with Nora Abusitta ICANN Translation staff: It was reported that ICANN will start working on updating and improving their glossaries in a manner that reflects the needs and requirements of the community. However, there is no evidence provided that the work has begun.

During the Friday, August 16, 2013, face to face meeting the Language Services team represented by Nora Abusitta and Christina Rodriguez shared an update on the status of the translation services. Staff mentioned initial budgetary constraints which were at the time of the discussion being addressed. More language staff should be hired as a result of the volume of work coming through to the team. This it is assumed should improve the timeliness of translation requests for the community. Presented by staff to ATRT2 is evidence that budget approved for service improvement FY14 in comparison to previous years as follows: 2012- US$ 2.1M ; 2013-US$ 2.9M and 2014-US$ 3.6M

On the alignment of ICANN translations to already used terminologies of the various languages, the language team reported that they were starting a language Glossary project for the six ICANN languages that would be aligned to terminology already in use.

Staff also shared the process involved as follows:

1. Receive the document for translation

2. Quick estimate of words per page multiply by days it takes to translate; 1 day -1800-2000 words

3. Document goes through polishing

The delay in getting the materials out at the same time is as a result of the size of the material to be translated and a lean department of two staff.

#### ****Day 2 - 15 August - Face-to-Face Meeting****

**Recordings:**

* [Part 1](http://icann.adobeconnect.com/p17n8q2y2qq/)
* [Part 2](http://icann.adobeconnect.com/p5fcx7t8u9i/)

[Chat Transcript](https://community.icann.org/download/attachments/41884187/chat+transcript+-+day+2.pdf?version=1&modificationDate=1376620716000)

**Transcript:** [**DAY 2**](https://community.icann.org/download/attachments/41884187/DAY2.pdf?version=1&modificationDate=1377345148000)

**Recommendation 22**

Steve Antonoff, Director of Human Resources, to the ATRT 2 request - Provide metric of multilingual senior staff at Dec 2010 as compared to current. In December 2010, ICANN had 38 individuals in Senior and Executive Management roles, of which 28 were multi-lingual (73.4%). Currently, in August 2013, there are 51 individuals in Senior and Executive Management roles, of which 39 are multi-lingual (76.5%). Staff reported that on the overall, ICANN staff speaks approximately 45 languages.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Level | On staff as of Dec 2010 | Multi-Lingual | On staff as of Aug 2013 | Multi-Lingual |
| Executive | 8 | 7 | 9 | 8 |
| Senior Mgmt | 30 | 21 | 42 | 31 |

No information was provided on any ongoing training to ICANN staff at any level in enhancing multi-lingual skills.

* Summary of community input on implementation, including effectiveness

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Document | Section (Part) | Wording | Actual translation | What it can mean | Correct translation |
| *A Next Generation Registration Directory Service* (2013) | Status of this **document** | **This is an initial report from the Expert Working Group on gTLD Directory Services (EWG) providing draft recommendations for a next generation gTLD Registration Directory Service (the “RDS”) to replace the current WHOIS system** | Настоящий документ ***представляет собой*** отчёт экспертной рабочей группы (ЭРГ) с рекомендациями по замене существующей системы WHOIS на ***службу каталогов регистрации рДВУ («СКР») следующего поколения*** | This is a [*initial* -missing] report of the Expert Working Group on [*draft* - missing] recommendations to replace the existing WHOIS system with *the office (service) of the catalogues of registration* of the *generic* Domains of the Top Level (abbreviation never used in Russian) of the *following* generation | **Настоящий документ является предварительным отчётом Экспертной рабочей группы (ЭРГ) с рекомендациями по замене системы WHOIS справочным сервисом нового поколения («ССНП») по регистрационным данным доменов общего пользования** |
| *WHOIS Policy Review Team Final Report* (2012) | Title | **WHOIS Policy Review Team // Final Report** | Группа ***проверки*** политики WHOIS // Итоговый отчёт | The Team on *Checking* WHOIS Policy // Final Report | **Группа по обзору политики WHOIS // Итоговый отчёт** |
| (*multiple documents*) |  | **Registry** | ***Реестр*** | register (list) | **регистратура** |
| (*multiple documents*) |  | **registrant** | ***владелец регистрации*** | owner of registration | **администратор домена** |
| (*multiple documents*) |  | **generic domain names** | ***родовые*** домены | ancestral, tribal domains | **домены общего пользования** |

* Summary of other relevant research

We have not gathered any other relevant material as yet

* Summary of other relevant information
* ATRT2 analysis of recommendation implementation (e.g. complete, incomplete or ongoing)

**Recommendation 19**

The implementation of the language policy is unsuccessful because;

1. The level to which translation is applied in the public participation process represents partial translation because the quality of translations is poor.
2. The ability to encourage public participation is limited to the availability of the full translation function.
3. The inability for participants to participate in the public comments process in their preferred language especially for the languages that ICANN claims to have established translation services. Community members receive material in their languages but cannot comment in the same language since the comments are expected back in English.
4. The timeliness of the translations to adhere to established policy has an impact on the ability for various ICANN language communities to effectively participate in the public comment periods. The translations of documents going out for public comments are delayed therefore there is not a uniform respond-time for all language communities which gives a comments process that is not completely equal to the respondents.

**Recommendation 22**

The implementation of recommendation 22 that states: that ICANN’s senior staffing arrangements are appropriately multi-lingual, delivering optimal levels of transparency and accountability to the community seems implemented successfully regarding the number of staff that is multi-lingual with more than 75% being multi-lingual.

The level of multilingual ability amongst ICANN senior staff represents ICANNs ability to ensure community participation at all levels of the organization. The question is if these skills are used in the communication with the community so that the staff delivers optimal level of transparency and accountability. Do the staff use their language skills when talking and writing with the non-English speaking community?

* ATRT2 assessment of recommendation effectiveness [Includes rationale for the recommendation.]

**Draft recommendation**

1. **Regarding Recommendation 19**   
   ICANN should review capacity of the language service department vs community need for the service and make relevant adjustments. The Language service is important to what ICANN does and its plans for the future based on the outreach program already in place.
2. **Regarding Recommendation 22**   
   The level of multi-lingual staff is very good at the moment but is there a written policy about the need for language skills for senior staff? And if hiring people without language skills the employee will be taken language courses?

**B. Proposed new recommendations**

* Hypothesis of problem
* Background research undertaken
  + Summary of ICANN input
  + Summary of community input
  + Summary of other relevant research
* Relevant ICANN bylaws/published policies/published procedures
* ATRT2 analysis & rationale
* Draft recommendation
* Public Comment on Draft Recommendations (to be completed later)
* Final recommendation (to be completed later)

Note: Links to relevant documents can be included, provided the link refers to a specific section of a given document. Alternatively, relevant section of other documents may be copies and pasted.