

2 May 2014

ICANN's Feedback to the Generation Panel Proposal for the Chinese Script Label Generation Ruleset for the Root Zone

Thank you for your response to the call for Generation Panels to Develop the Root Zone Label Generation Rules. We sincerely thank each of the group members for offering their time and expertise to volunteer on the Chinese Script Generation Panel. Please find below ICANN's feedback to the proposal to form the Chinese Script Generation Panel.

Following the submission of your proposal, we reviewed the proposal and obtained advice from the Integration Panel in accordance with the [Procedure to Develop and Maintain the Label Generation Rules for the Root Zone in respect of IDNA Labels](#) (LGR procedure) and as outlined in the [Call for Generation Panels to Develop Root Zone Label Generation Rules](#).

We find that the proposal, as submitted, would require some adjustments to meet the required criteria set forth in the [LGR Procedure](#), and in particular the criteria set forth in the [Call for Generation Panels to Develop Root Zone Label Generation Rules](#), for the seating of the Chinese Script Generation Panel. We have described these adjustments and our rationale below.

Review Criteria:

The following list of criteria has been taken into account in reviewing the panel's proposal.

General Criteria:

- Is the script relevant to the LGR?
- Is the Unicode subset clearly identified?
- Is the repertoire within the MSR?
- Are all principal languages listed?
- Are all significant countries listed?
- Are all relevant related scripts listed?

Panel-Specific Criteria:

- Are there enough members?
- Are they representative of their linguistic communities?
- Does the combined expertise adequately cover the target writing system?
- Does the combined expertise include ICANN policy and process?
- Does the panel contain adequate DNS/IDNA/Unicode expertise?
- Does the candidate chair appear to meet the required qualifications including recognition in the community?

Is there enough diversity in the panel (different economic interests, different institutional affiliation, members from outside of ICANN)?

Is the script unrelated to any other Script? If no, does the proposal identify the relation and address the necessary coordination?

Is the proposal sufficiently inclusive of relevant linguistic, regional and political communities?

Work Plan:

Is the timeline realistic?

Are the meeting schedules realistic?

Does the proposal adequately address issues of funding?

Does the panel membership cover the required expertise? If no, which expertise is lacking?

Suggestions and Comments:

Please find below our suggestions and comments on the proposal based on the review criteria summarized above. This paragraph offers comments and suggestions for where the proposal did not satisfactorily meet the criteria.

General Criteria:

The proposal has to clearly identify and state the target script(s), language(s) and corresponding Unicode subset(s) for the proposed Generation Panel scope of work. **It remains unclear which scripts are covered in the scope of work.** The proposal is expected to include plans for coordination with other Generation Panels for related scripts.

Unicode ranges of targeted script(s) may also be restricted by various factors, such as protocol-DISALLOWED characters, RFCs defined restrictions, the [Maximal Starting Repertoire](#) (MSR), etc. It is important for the proposal to note existing restrictions and to mention, as stated in the LGR Procedure, that the starting point on which the Generation Panel will base its work is the MSR, currently available for public comment. It is advised that the proposed Generation Panel review the published MSR and provide feedback to the Integration Panel. If anticipated, the proposal may include this review as a separate phase of the work in panel's work plan.

In clearly defining the list of relevant related scripts and Unicode ranges, we recommend that the proposal include indication of prior work (e.g., IDN tables) that the proposed panel would like to draw upon in designing its LGR proposal(s).

Panel Specific Criteria:

With regards to the composition of the proposed Generation Panel, we acknowledge that additional members are currently being recruited and will be added to the panel.

ICANN staff continues to implement worldwide outreach efforts for the implementation of the LGR project and may support and help disseminate the on-going outreach efforts currently executed by existing members of the proposed panel.

Please explain clearly how the membership of the proposed panel adequately addressed representation in terms of linguistic communities, economic interests and institutional affiliations, as well as inclusiveness of relevant linguistic, regional and political communities.

As requested in the call, Generation Panels are expected to have members with the appropriate skills to perform the substantive work of creating the script LGR. Taking into account the complex nature of the repertoire to be considered by the Chinese Script Generation Panel, it is advised that the proposal explicitly document the expertise of existing members, specifically in the areas of character-encoding and script expertise. In addition, please note that the use of additional expertise through advisors is made available by ICANN for Generation Panels. Currently, ICANN has retained the following advisors:

<https://community.icann.org/display/croscomlgrprocedure/Advisors>.

Additional advisors may be added to this list upon request by the panels and approval by ICANN.

Work Plan:

We acknowledge and encourage the LGR work currently being performed by the members of proposed panel. Within the review of the submitted proposal, we encourage the members to further detail the key tasks and allotted times of the suggested work plan. It is also desirable to give more concrete details on the Generation Panel's plans for choice of user communities for gathering "public comments", including their regional diversity.

Any Other Issues Identified:

Upon review of the criteria for whether the proposal is sufficiently inclusive of relevant linguistic communities, we noted that the proposal neither lists ChuNom (Vietnamese written using Han characters) nor provides justification for why Vietnamese representation is not required on any Han panel.

On the technical specifications part of the proposal, we noted the following:

- The proposal lists all ranges of Unified ideographs in Unicode, but does not list any of the compatibility ranges, including the 12 unified (non-compatibility) ideographs contained in one of these ranges.
- The proposal does not account for the fact that 62 code points from Extension B are part of existing IDN tables.
- Pending future additions of ideographs are worth noting if they are critical code points for modern use in some part of the community and/or if they are part of a set

of variants including existing code points, as well as recommendation of how they can be accommodated in a future revision of the LGR without leading to compatibility issues.

- The proposal mentions references to the relevant encoding standards and number of unified ideographs. It is recommended to include specification on versions of the two standards as well as the fact that both standards define the total of 74,617 CJK Unified Ideographs.

Collaborating with the Integration Panel on the LGR work:

We have taken into account that the proposed Generation Panel is working on defined key tasks of the LGR work, and we suggest that the panel members engage in a dialogue with the Integration Panel where needed, even preceding the first submission. This dialogue would be a very useful way for panel members to be alerted early in cases where the Integration Panel anticipates problems with some features of the submission. Alternatively, it would give the Generation Panel an early opportunity to explain why it is making certain decisions and why they are the right ones for IDN TLD labels and variants for its script. Part of such early dialogue may be the distribution of preliminary drafts. To enable this, ICANN has set up the LGR@icann.org mailing list to facilitate communications on matters related to LGR. Public archive of exchanges taking place on this mailing list are available at: <http://mm.icann.org/pipermail/lgr/>. All members of the proposed Chinese Script Generation Panel will be subscribed to this list.