

Attendance:

Chuck Gomes
David Maher
Greg Shatan
Heather Forrest
Osvaldo Novoa
Stephane Hankins

Audio Only:

Thomas Rickert

Apologies:

Christopher Lamb
Alan Greenberg

Staff:

Berry Cobb
Dennis Chang
Mary Wong
Andrea Glandon

AC Chat:

Andrea Glandon:Welcome to the IGO INGO PDP Working Group on Red Cross Names call held on Thursday, 02 August 2018 at 14:00 UTC.

Heather Forrest:Sorry for joining late - just dropped off an IPC call

Greg Shatan:Heather, long time no see!

Heather Forrest:exactly, Greg :)

Heather Forrest:I couldn't agree more, Chuck. This is not an optimal outcome for the PDP or the vote in Council

Heather Forrest:Chuck, your points are noted and I'll be sure they find their way into PDP 3.0

Berry Cobb:"Possible response" The WG respects the general principle of protecting the freedom of speech. However, lack of participation in the WG nor any submission of position in the WG's deliberations is an illustration on issues of participation. There was no opportunity to debate the pros and cons of positions within the WG. Further, the finite list is an instrument by which that freedom of speech is not harmed. Further, the aspect of confusion is greater issue that should be considered."

Osvaldo Novoa:Hello all, sorry I'm late

Berry Cobb:"The WG respects the general principle of protecting the freedom of speech. However, lack of participation in the WG nor any submission of position in the WG's deliberations is an illustration on issues of participation. There was no opportunity to debate the pros and cons of positions within the WG. Further, the finite list is an instrument by which that freedom of speech is not harmed. Further, the aspect of confusion is greater issue that should be considered. In substance, the principle is agreed, but after long and reasonable deliberations, it was determined a legitimate need in protecting this singular set of identifiers."

Heather Forrest:Berry I might tinker a bit - will drop in some edits shortly

Greg Shatan:Feel free to steal more of my ramblings....

Greg Shatan:Which I hope are recorded for posterity.

Greg Shatan:We were careful ... the NCSG comment wasn't.

Mary Wong:@Chuck, yes - the recommendations do not allow for just any kind of change to the list. It is either a clear error correction or other accuracy issue, or a substantive change based on RC society status.

Mary Wong:@Thomas, yes - the WG should acknowledge the comment and explain why it does not, in the WG's view, require any changes in the recommendation.

Chuck Gomes:The CPH recommendations regarding implementation seem doable to me.

Heather Forrest:Hi Berry, all: some possible revisions to Berry's initial draft response to the NCSG comments

Heather Forrest:The WG respects the general principle of protecting the freedom of speech, and has given this serious consideration in the context of the finite and very limited nature of the list of protected names, being names corresponding to the official names of national Red Cross societies. This list was compiled by the International Red Cross and carefully reviewed by the WG and relevant supporting experts. The WG considers it unfortunate that these comments were not raised during the WG's deliberations, and further that they did not take into account the extensive discussions that the reconvened WG has had to specifically ensure the legitimate basis for and finite nature of the list of protected names. On reflection the WG is confident that free speech considerations, whilst not raised during the reconvened WG's discussions, have been adequately taken into account.

Chuck Gomes:I like Heather's version.

Heather Forrest:Thanks for reading it into the record, Berry - much appreciated

Stephane Hankins:Dear all, we will I assume be able to revise some wording to Heather's proposed text (e.g. the reference to National Red Cross "or Red Crescent" Societies; etc.). I may provide subsequently

Chuck Gomes:Thanks David

Stephane Hankins:This is fine thank you

Mary Wong:Hand up, Berry :)

Heather Forrest:Ah yes - I see now the critical difference between Rec 5 (changes) and Rec 6 (corrections). So sorry Berry - I missed this point. Apologies, it's 0100 am here and my mind isn't as sharp as I would like it to be

Mary Wong:What about "formal channel"?

Berry Cobb:proper?

Mary Wong:That's exactly it, Greg.

Chuck Gomes:Regarding Mary's comments about the GAC, what if we changed 'important' to 'essential'? I think 'essential' says more than 'formal'.

Greg Shatan:I will wear white tie and tails if we put in formal.

Stephane Hankins:Cannot speak somehow

Stephane Hankins:please

Chuck Gomes:Not hearing anyone now.

Heather Forrest:Mary I can hear you

Heather Forrest:Chuck it seems your audio has dropped

Chuck Gomes:I cannot hear Mary.

Chuck Gomes:I will dial back in.

Chuck Gomes:I am back and have audio.

Mary Wong:We can work with that, Stephane - it seems clear that we all understand what this para is getting at, and your (RC's) situation.

Mary Wong:The main idea is still to keep it a clear process where only official communications are the ones recognized as needing action.

Heather Forrest:Absolutely no problem, Berry - necessary work here

Heather Forrest:And the Vice Chairs are on the ICANN63 call

Chuck Gomes:What was decided about recommendations 5 & 6 when I lost audio?

Mary Wong:@Chuck, they cover 2 different type of changes - #5 to the list itself, #6 are inaccuracies, so not redundant. It's clearer in the full text section (rather than Exec Summary). On the issue of how to characterize the GAC, we are probably going with "formal" or "essential". On who can spot errors, we will add soething about registry operators.

Chuck Gomes:Thanks Mary.

Andrea Glandon:No worries on the audio bridge, okay to go over

Mary Wong:Thanks Stephane - but "Red Star of David" is not included on the list, I think.

Berry Cobb:Correct. Red Star of David and Lion et Soleil Rouges are not on our finite list.

Greg Shatan:It sounds like Red Star of David should be included as well.

Mary Wong:That is good to hear, Stephane, as the list is what is supposed to be finite and, as you say, was developed (with a lot of work on your part) in consultation with ALL the National Societies.

Chuck Gomes:No objection from me.

Mary Wong:@Berry, yes - the RC acronyms are pending the resolution of the IGO acronyms issue.

Greg Shatan:"American" is not a language... Maybe, a dialect. :-)

Mary Wong:All, the point is that what is on the list from this group is what becomes the finite list. For all other names (not acronyms), if they have not been reserved under the Consesus Policy now in effect - which only applies to Red Cross, Red Crescent, Red Crystal and Red Lion & Sun, in all 6 UN languages - they will NOT be reserved after our recommendations are implemented.

Greg Shatan:Mary, I'm just making sure that Red Star of David and Mogen David Adom are on the finite list. Is that correct?

Mary Wong:@Greg, that is what Berry is asking for feedback on.

Mary Wong:Heather has the final say on the motion.

Greg Shatan:Feedback from the rest of the WG?

Heather Forrest:I'll submit the motion in good time for the 6th deadline, thanks

Chuck Gomes:Thanks to everyone for your work in this reconvened WG.

Mary Wong:@Greg, yes - as the Red Star of David name was NOT requested by any National Society.

Mary Wong:@Stephane, yes - if it is the French version of "Red Lion & Sun" it should be covered by the Consensus Policy now in effect.

Mary Wong:The Council can defer but just for one meeting if the motion to vote is proposed for August.

Chuck Gomes:Special thanks to Thomas for chairing, and to Stephane and ICANN staff for the incredible work they have done.

Dennis Chang:Thanks you all for considering the implementation. I inivte you all to join the IRT.

Heather Forrest:Thank you Thomas, Beryy and Mary

Stephane Hankins:I will send revisions to paragraphs as agreed (Heather's text and the other paragraph on page 13). Thank you to all

Berry Cobb:Stephane, please send those ASAP, I'd like to get all documents back to the WG in the next 4 hour sor so.

Mary Wong:Thank you Thomas and everyone for coming on this unprecedented journey in such a collaborative manner!

Greg Shatan:Bye all!

Osvaldo Novoa:Bye all