

Attendance:

Avri Doria
Chris Casavale
Christopher Wilkinson
David McAuley
Erich Schweighofer
Flip Petillion
Greg Shatan
GZ Kabir
Heather Forrest
Javier Rua-Jovet
Jeff Neuman
Justine Chew
Martin Sutton
Michael Flemming
Mzia Gogilashvili
Nick Wenban-Smith
Olga Cavalli
Raymond Mamattah
Sophie Hey
Yrjo Lansipuro

Audio only:

Bram Fudzulani
Apologies:
Annebeth lange
Maureen Hilyard
Alberto Soto
Jim Prendergast
Ann-Cathrin Marcussen

Staff:

Steve Chan
Julie Hedlund
Michelle DeSmyter

AC chat:

Michelle DeSmyter: Dear all, Welcome to the New gTLD Subsequent Procedures Sub Team – Track 5 – Geographic Names at the Top Level call on Wednesday, 27 February 2019 at 05:00 UTC.

Michelle DeSmyter:Agenda wiki page: <https://community.icann.org/x/opUWBg>
Michelle DeSmyter:Google doc: [https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_1WKSC-5FpPBviCnbHxW171ZIp4CzuhQXRCV1NR2ruagrxs_edit-3Fusp-3Dsharing&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3Pjp6wrcrwill3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe_5iHWGIBLwwwhehFBfjrsjWv9&m=Oqbfj_aPnuCbOwY7BoN4HaNjQoaXW83O6EVxW9RMD2c&s=wET3ryv5XDwHkQitp4f5pUjcCnEY3R9vVQBj6X8NzyA&e=\[docs.google.com\]](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_1WKSC-5FpPBviCnbHxW171ZIp4CzuhQXRCV1NR2ruagrxs_edit-3Fusp-3Dsharing&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3Pjp6wrcrwill3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe_5iHWGIBLwwwhehFBfjrsjWv9&m=Oqbfj_aPnuCbOwY7BoN4HaNjQoaXW83O6EVxW9RMD2c&s=wET3ryv5XDwHkQitp4f5pUjcCnEY3R9vVQBj6X8NzyA&e=[docs.google.com]).

Martin Sutton:Hi everyone. I will be on mute most of the time to avoid waking any of the family (they can turn nasty!)

Olga Cavalli - Co-lead:Hi Martin! hi colleagues

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):Hi everyone...

GZ Kabir:hello olga !

David McAuley:Hello all

Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):Hi to all: hola a todos!

Yrjö Länsipuro:Hi all!

Christopher Wilkinson:Good morning: @Martin - I am hiding in the kitchen and have moved the kit there for that reason!!

Martin Sutton:@Christopher - no raiding the fridge!

Flip Petillion GNSO Council Liaison:Hi everybody. I'll be on mute - it's early morning here - I want to avoid waking family members. Flip

Julie Hedlund:Please see the document

at: https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_1WKSC-5FpPBviCnbHxW171ZIp4CzuhQXRCV1NR2ruagrxs_edit-23gid-3D0&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3Pjp6wrcrwill3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe_5iHWGIBLwwwhehFBfjrsjWv9&m=Oqbfj_aPnuCbOwY7BoN4HaNjQoaXW83O6EVxW9RMD2c&s=XjqeZ9IY-G6e35SF2fSoV8tKbLqKKygiuRZb9ivRdKE&e=

https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_1WKSC-5FpPBviCnbHxW171ZIp4CzuhQXRCV1NR2ruagrxs_edit-23gid-3D0&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3Pjp6wrcrwill3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe_5iHWGIBLwwwhehFBfjrsjWv9&m=Oqbfj_aPnuCbOwY7BoN4HaNjQoaXW83O6EVxW9RMD2c&s=XjqeZ9IY-G6e35SF2fSoV8tKbLqKKygiuRZb9ivRdKE&e=

Mzia Gogilashvili:Hello everyone!

Martin Sutton:Will do Olga

Steve Chan:Please note, these summary statements are pulled from the general comments, reviewed last meeting. A WT5 member suggested that it made sense to pull that information into the review of the recommendations for context.

Steve Chan:This is one of the rare cases where staff has not merely allowed the comments speak for themselves.

Heather Forrest:I have to drop off the AC but will join the audio bridge.

Christopher Wilkinson:Sound is failing intermittently

Michelle DeSmyter:Sound is good

Martin Sutton:thats good

David McAuley:my sound ok

Flip Petillion GNSO Council Liaison:there are no row indications in the document in AC, can staff send the excell doc ?

Martin Sutton:[https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_1WKSC-5FpPBviCnbHxW171ZIp4CzuhQXRCV1NR2ruagrxs_edit-3Fusp-3Dsharing&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3Pjp6wrcrwill3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe_5iHWGIBLwwwhehFBfjrsjWv9&m=Oqbfj_aPnuCbOwY7BoN4HaNjQoaXW83O6EVxW9RMD2c&s=wET3ryv5XDwHkQitp4f5pUjcCnEY3R9vVQBj6X8NzyA&e=\[docs.google.com\]](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_1WKSC-5FpPBviCnbHxW171ZIp4CzuhQXRCV1NR2ruagrxs_edit-3Fusp-3Dsharing&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3Pjp6wrcrwill3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe_5iHWGIBLwwwhehFBfjrsjWv9&m=Oqbfj_aPnuCbOwY7BoN4HaNjQoaXW83O6EVxW9RMD2c&s=wET3ryv5XDwHkQitp4f5pUjcCnEY3R9vVQBj6X8NzyA&e=[docs.google.com])

[3Dsharing&d=Dw/fAQ&c=FmY1u3Pjp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWI PqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSF04VShFqESGe_5iHWGIBLwwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=Oqbfj_aPnu CbOwY7BoN4HaNjQoaXW83O6EVxW9RMD2c&s=wET3ryv5XDwHkQitp4f5pUjcCnEY3R9v VQBJ6X8NzyA&e=\[docs.google.com\]](https://docs.google.com/dw/fAQ&c=FmY1u3Pjp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWI PqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSF04VShFqESGe_5iHWGIBLwwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=Oqbfj_aPnu CbOwY7BoN4HaNjQoaXW83O6EVxW9RMD2c&s=wET3ryv5XDwHkQitp4f5pUjcCnEY3R9v VQBJ6X8NzyA&e=)

Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):Thx @Martin

Flip Petillion GNSO Council Liaison:Thanks Martin

Steve Chan:We are at the bottom of page 8 in the document in the AC room, if anyone is using that instead.

Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):Thanks @steve

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):Page 11 in the AC room

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):Now page 12 in the AC

Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):No

Justine Chew:No

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):All good Olga

Martin Sutton:If anyone has any comments - particular to identify new substantive comments not considered before, or you think the classification applied is incorrect, please speak up or add to the chat box. thank you.

Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):+1 @Martin

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):Page 14 in AC now

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):15

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):This section is mainly agreement with just a little Concern and a sprinkle of divergence so a clear TREND can be identified...

Justine Chew:Registry Stakeholder Group

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):Now into page 18 in the AC room doc

Martin Sutton:Great progress Olga

Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):Onwards!

David McAuley:100 out of 241

Martin Sutton:Hand up from CW

Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):hand up @christopher

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):Another example where the recommendation is showing mainly agreement with just a little Concern and a sprinkle of divergence so a TREND can be identified...

Steve Chan:Page 19

Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):@Christopher you are muted

Steve Chan:Page 20

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):beat me to it @Steve ;-)

Steve Chan:I already have it typed CLO, just waiting to press enter: Page 21

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):21

Steve Chan:I'm cheating :)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):-)

Steve Chan:Christopher, maybe type your comment/question?

Martin Sutton:AS Cheryl would say "Another example where the recommendation is showing mainly agreement with just a little Concern and a sprinkle of divergence so a TREND"

Steve Chan:page 22

Justine Chew:And pretty consistent throughout

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):@Martin I suspect you copied and pasted... gee between you and @Steve ;-)

Steve Chan:Stealing your thunder CLO!

Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):@CLO and her unquestionable command of Shakespeare's language.

Steve Chan:page 23 done and now on 24

Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):None.

Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):there!

David McAuley:page numbers show up on my adobe - i see 24/45 right now

David McAuley:on bar below text

David McAuley:agree with Christopher re size - my adobe text is tiny and so toggling between adobe and web spreadsheet

Steve Chan:@Christopher, the easiest way to view the comments is generally in the Google document, if you're able to access there instead.

David McAuley:+1 Olga - amazing organizational work in spreadsheet

David McAuley:spreadsheet

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):This is why we recommend you have the spreadsheet open on a second screen or computer if possible I work 2 screens on a 15" screen and use 75% as the view in the spreadsheet switching between the two as needs be... we also try to keep listing here what page we are up to in the AC room doc

Martin Sutton:@CW you can enlarge the presentation screen in Adobe and follow the page number quoted on the bar

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):none of us find this a perfect system

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):Bottom of page 24 in the AC screen

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):@Martin your que to past again noting a little more divergence in the sea of green /sprinkle of orange...

Steve Chan:Page 25 and now 26

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):P26

Steve Chan:And now 27

Steve Chan:For the NCSG comment, I believe this part is actually Agreement: The NCSG does not support reservation of strings resulting from permutations and transpositions of alpha-3 codes listed in the ISO 3166-1.

Justine Chew:Line 153 is divergence and agreement by INTA; @Olga, I think you said concern and agreement

Steve Chan:Any objections to that change?

Justine Chew:@Olga, it's okay, no harm done :)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):Fine by me @Steve

Martin Sutton:Agree Steve

Justine Chew:+1 Steve on NCSG change to that portion

Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):No objection @Steve

Steve Chan:Thanks. And we are on page 28.

Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):Thanks @Justine

Steve Chan:And already on 30

Steve Chan:And now 31

Steve Chan:Page 32

Steve Chan:33

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):34
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):35
Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):None.
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):36
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):now 37
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):38 in the AC Room
Justine Chew:Who is Georgia?
Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):Country
Steve Chan:The Government of Georgie
David McAuley:One hour mark – through 209, a tour de force, Olga, well done
Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):I think @Mzsia, who is on this call reps Georgia in GAC
Justine Chew:Can we state "The Government of Georgia" then please?
Steve Chan:@Justine, perhaps? But that was what was referenced in the letter.
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):page 39 in AC
Justine Chew:@Steve: Hmmm
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):41
Steve Chan:@Justine, same as say, Singapore simply referring to itself as Singapore in its comment. Several commenters did the same thing.
Justine Chew:@Steve: Right. I know people with the name "Georgia" but no one by the name "Singapore" :)
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):42
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):and there is the STATE of Georgia as well
David McAuley:And it is late here but not on the midnight train to georgia, the state
Christopher Wikinson:which page are we on?
Martin Sutton:42
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):David ;-) you know i have that tune in my head now don't you...
David McAuley:sorry bout that @CLO
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):'could be worse @David...
David McAuley:;-)
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):page 44 in AC
Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):Yep, as country/state names go, "Georgia" is one that usually requires extra qualification, as you not only have the Republic of Georgia, but a US subnational unit (or state) also named Georgia, and also it can be a female proper name in English. No such issues for Singapore!
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):P45 end of Tab
David McAuley:indicating applause for Olga
Mzia Gogilashvili:I support Javier
David McAuley:Thank you staff for this document - tremendous amount of work
Martin Sutton:Does anyone have any observations from the comments to the Prelim Recommendations?
Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):gamarjoba @Mzsia!
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):Yes it makes a HUGE difference with this spreadsheet
Steve Chan:@David, all, glad you all find it useful.
Martin Sutton:In particular, any strong signals to change recommendations?

Michelle DeSmyter:Next meeting after Kobe is Wednesday, 27 March 2019 at 14:00 UTC
Justine Chew:I will defer to Mzia and remember that "Georgia" means "Georgia (country)", thanks. :)

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):It seems that the comments reflect the discussions of this group. Not unexpected. However, we need to get to a position of what can we live with. We need to get to a point where we have the appropriate incentives to come up with a solution we can all be equally happy or equally unhappy about.

Martin Sutton:Indeed Steve - thanks

Martin Sutton:Good to have made this progress today

Justine Chew:9 March

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):Would love to discuss in Kobe how we can truly make the multi-stakeholder model work to come up with something that will satisfy a Consensus.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):Indeed Martin

Mzia Gogilashvili:Gamarjoba, @Javier! :)

Nick Wenban-Smith, Nominet 2:@ Martin I don't see any momentum to change any of the initial recommendations

Martin Sutton:Thx Nick, noted

Martin Sutton:Hand up for CW

Martin Sutton:CW - where is the remark that a TM would "trump" a different application, such as a community/geo?

Martin Sutton:Could you please indicate which comment refers to your concern?

Martin Sutton:Please, thx Olga

Martin Sutton:No they dont

Martin Sutton:If two applicatios were received, one from TM one from Geo, there is no refereence to which would prevail

Nick Wenban-Smith, Nominet 2:@ Christopher isn't there a high degree of support for the 2012 position? and where there is opposition one way there is also opposition in the other direction

Christopher Wikinson:Lost sound again. Have a good trip to ICANN 64. Good b'ye

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):Thanks @Christopher

Justine Chew:CW you can join us at ICANN 64 remotely

Christopher Wikinson:I will try to join remotely, subject to the time zones.

Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):My excuses to all @ Kobe. I will try to join remotely as possible.

Flip Petillion GNSO Council Liaison:Thank you and see you in Kobe !

Steve Chan:Nothing from me, thanks!

David McAuley:Thanks Olga, staff, and all, lookks like done early

Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):Great great progress

Justine Chew:Thanks @Olga, @Steve and @Julie

Martin Sutton:Feel free to put forward suggestions for WT5 meetings in Kobe, which will be on the Saturday morning (3 hrs)

Javier Rua-Jovet (ALAC):Bye to all; adios a todos! Gracias @Olga. Extraordinario progreso hoy!

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):Bye for now people Safe Tavel's to those going to Kobe and yes please remember remote participations as well... Thanks everyone

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):Very true @olga

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (@CLO3 - PDP Co-Chair):Much Much more to come people :-)

Martin Sutton: Thank you Olga and everyone, bye and safe travels to those heading to Kobe. See you there.

Nick Wenban-Smith, Nominet 2: thanks olga

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC): Ciao!

Erich Schweighofer: Servus from Vienna