

44 Members

Alan Greenberg	Justine Chew
Alexander Schubert	Karen Day
Alison Simpson	Katrin Ohlmer
Annebeth Lange	Kavouss Arasteh
Avri Doria	Klaus Stoll
Bruna Santos	Krishna Seeburn
Cheryl Langdon-Orr	Kristina Rosette
Christa Taylor	Kurt Pritz
Christopher Niemi	Marc Palau
Christopher Wilkinson	Martin Sutton
Dietmar Lenden	Maxim Alzoba
Donna Austin	Michael Flemming
Gg Leine	Phil Buckingham
Greg Shatan	Phil Marano
Hadia Elminiawi	Poncelet Ileleji
Harold Arcos	Robin Gross
Heather Forrest	Rudy Mendoza
Jamie Baxter	Sara Bockey
Jessica Hooper	Sophia Feng
Jim Prendergast	Sophie Hey
Jon Nevett	Susan Payne
Judy Song-Marshall	Vanda Scartezini

Audio Only:

None

Apologies:

Olga Cavalli

Staff:

Steve Chan

Emily Barabas

Dennis Chang

Berry Cobb

Trang Nguyen

Michelle DeSmyter

Adobe Connect chat transcript for Monday, 11 December 2017

Michelle DeSmyter:Dear All, welcome to the New gTLD Subsequent Procedures Working Group call on Monday, 11 December 2017 at 15:00 UTC

Michelle DeSmyter:Agenda wiki page:

https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_community.icann.org_x_SQxyB&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrw113mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSF04VShFqESGe_5iHWG1BLwwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=1QL0SRLI00Y1Csg_v2n5oQIPw1UfCxKwyCt3ZE6WLTQ&s=k3zbWL4loxT3JxKHuXE0uE06TWyTnwIH81IP1JgbsRU&e=

Marc Palau:Is my micro off?

Michelle DeSmyter:no , your mic is open

Marc Palau:can't find where to mute it

Michelle DeSmyter:I just sent you a private chat

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):Hello all, I am 8n transit , will chat mostly (too loud here)

Michelle DeSmyter:Hello Maxim, welcome, thank you so much.

Vanda Scartezini:hi everyone... wonderful spring day here....

Annebeth Lange,WT5:Hi all, still snow in Oslo!

Kavouss Arasteh:Heavy raining since yesterday in Geneva

Poncelet Ileleji:Hello All

Emily Barabas:Slides are currently unsynched.

Emily Barabas:The google doc is here:

https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_1mA-5FhTUhLhJSsfcmoQwREtUqxykZ5KfJffzJAAhEvN1A_edit-23gid-3D0&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrw113mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSF04VShFqESGe_5iHWG1BLwwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=1QL0SRLI00Y1Csg_v2n5oQIPw1UfCxKwyCt3ZE6WLTQ&s=loug3-xoSRRbFLDQSiMhhjJYyd7fzd06zzCryFUB2eo&e=

Hadia Elminiawi:Hi all

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):please read out my comment: page 14 , GEO potentially can limit registrations to residents of the same aarea

Michael Flemming:I'm good

Michael Flemming:That was great, thx

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):Waiting for operator . . .

Steve Chan:Any luck Kristina? If not, Michelle can probably provide an assist.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr::-)

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):Was also waiting - very annoying music. But in now.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr:There were some tech challenges for the WT5 last call Buty we hope that wil not reoccur

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):Me too. (4:15, if ICANN is keeping data on that sort of thing)

Steve Chan:@Maxim, if you don't mind, would it be ok to hold off on reading your comment until we get to relevant section?

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):@Steve , yes

kavouss Arasteh:I do not agree with your conclusions

kavouss Arasteh:The issue of Georaphic name isc much beyond the leadership of GNSO

kavouss Arasteh:The issue is disagreement on whether PDP is relevant here

kavouss Arasteh:There seems to be that our concerns are not heard

Greg Shatan:This is a GNSO PDP Working Group. That is a fundamental fact. The issue of gTLD policy is the raisin d'etre for the GNSO.

kavouss Arasteh:It is a cross community issue and not GNSO issue

Greg Shatan:That is certainly your opinion, and thank you for your personal views.

kavouss Arasteh:I am speaking from my own side here

Robin Gross:We need to follow the rules, not break them in order to privilege one of the groups that isn't happy with them.

kavouss Arasteh:WHAT Rules Dear Mdam

kavouss Arasteh:MADAM'

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):in any case GEO TLDs had to obtain letter of approval from the relevant local/federal governmental body

kavouss Arasteh:0

Greg Shatan:Robin, we don't know that any group is asking for that. Only a single member of a group.

Robin Gross:Good point, Greg.

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:exactly

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):or letter of non objection from the same governmental body

kavouss Arasteh:It is not surprising that you want the domination of GNSO with its PDP Rules to be applied to Geographic names

Emily Barabas:Slide 6

Steve Chan:As referenced by Cheryl, GNSO Operating Procedures, which are inclusive of the GNSO Working Group Guidelines and PDP Manual: https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_gnso.icann.org_en_council_op-2Dprocedures-2D01sep16-2Den.pdf&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl13mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSF04VShFqESGe_5iHWG1BLwwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=1QL0SRLI00Y1Csg_v2n5oQIPw1UfcxKwyCt3ZE6WLTQ&s=J01kT5n0aw2BIwaGWks_9Is8WBqgHUScS4yKDz5Ly_A&e=

kavouss Arasteh:Geographic names are not the property of any group. It belongs to the citizen of all countries

Greg Shatan:Cheryl is a member of ALAC. Not sure how that contributes to anyone's lack of surprise.

Martin Sutton:@ Kavous - the GNSO is the vehicle for addressing the policy issue but allows all to be involved. All concerns and views are taken into consideration. Ultimately, all of the 4 leading groups and other advisory groups will have further opportunities to comment on any output from WT5.

Greg Shatan:Kavouss, your personal views on that matter have been amply stated and heard.

kavouss Arasteh:Dear Greg, we have difference of view in that subject

kavouss Arasteh:The decision making process must be fully and freely and transparently be discussed without people attack others s

Kurt Pritz:I think we might distinguish between the policy-based (i.e., in the Guidebook) categories: Community and Geographic; vs those that were inserted via independent discussion afterward:

Donna Austin, Neustar:Can we spell out NGPC please for some that weren't around in 2012

Greg Shatan:No one is attacking anyone.

kavouss Arasteh:The so-called Rough consensus of GNSO shall not be applied to decide on the geographic names

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:we are not attacking anyone the need for balance is what it is all about

Steve Chan:NGPC = New gTLD Program Committee. Thanks Donna for the reminder.

Heather Forrest:I agree that it is sensible to make the distinction that Kurt has raised between community policy-based and independent agreement

Donna Austin, Neustar:Thanks Steve, I honestly couldn't remember.

kavouss Arasteh:There is no clear description on community

Greg Shatan:Kavouss, this is a GNSO PDP WG as Cheryl noted, so we will be following GNSO consensus definitions.

kavouss Arasteh:If there is what is that?

kavouss Arasteh:There is nalso no clear idea on how communities requirements to be compared with each other

kavouss Arasteh:There should be opprotunity to others to talk and not one person contineously takes the floor

Sara Bockey:which slide are we on?

Kurt Pritz:My point earlier was that there is consensus policy on geo and Community categories and no consensus policy on closed generics and brands so the latter "categories" deserve more discussion and should not be considered a status quo consensus policy

Vanda Scartezini:i have sent some comments to wt 2 to discuss about a possible change for gTlds , but still need to WT to discuss this

Steve Chan:Sara, we are on slide 8

kavouss Arasteh:Dear Co- Chairs, I asked a clear description of community and getegorizations between various communities. No answer was provided

Sara Bockey:thank you. my screen has a poltergeist today and is running back and forth. so weird.

kavouss Arasteh:Could one consider drug traffic group as a community?i

Jim Prendergast:While we did have some lengthy disucssions on closed generics in WT2, there is still some healthy oppostion to the concept so I dont know how settled that issue is.

kavouss Arasteh:If we have to abide to AGB then why we discuss the matter any more?

Robin Gross:I suppose a pharmacy group could apply as a community.

kavouss Arasteh:Those issues were written some 10 years ago and situation has changed drastically

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):AGB might change as result f some PDP work

Marc Palau:What about family names? that's not an strict community

Marc Palau:like .kim

Steve Chan:@Kavouss, the description of the AGB was to set the stage and to identify what took place in the 2012 round. As Maxim notes, things can change in the future as a result of the work of this PDP.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):it might depend on wealth of the family

Greg Shatan:@Maxim, exactly; that is why this PDP exists....

kavouss Arasteh:Dear Colleagues, I am eligible to raise questions without being criticized or repressed is it not so?

Marc Palau:@Maxim are you joking?

avri doria:Aren't there also other conditions in the AGB against criminal behaviors and activities?

kavouss Arasteh:What are those categories?

kavouss Arasteh:We need to revisit the definition of community and revisit various categories of communities as they are not having the same conditions

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):I think GAC advise might play it's role into prevent such bad actor's communities

kavouss Arasteh:As soon as we raise a legitimate question , a valanch of disagreement comes up without giving a convincing argument

kavouss Arasteh:Sorry, may you please advise me " What is meant by Public interests"

kavouss Arasteh:WHO determines whether an issue is considered to be public community or not

kavouss Arasteh:Dear Madam, the term public interests came several times and we , the CCWG for accountability m, were not able to describe that and just leave it vague

kavouss Arasteh:Whenever we make a comment ,we are said " it is not subject of

kavouss Arasteh:TODAY? Then it would subject of what sday pls ?

kavouss Arasteh:Day?

Emily Barabas:Here is the link to the Google doc:

https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_1mA-5FhTUhLhJSsfcmoQwREtUqxykZ5KfJffzJAAhEvNlA_edit-23gid-3D0&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl13mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe_5iHWG1BLwwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=1QL0SRLI00Y1Csg_v2n5oQIPw1UfcxKwyCt3ZE6WLTQ&s=loug3-xoSRrbfLDQSiMhhjJYyd7fzd06zzCryFUB2eo&e=

kavouss Arasteh:Is it an intimidation dear co- chair????

Annebeth Lange,WT5:When you are talking about PDP, do you then consequently mean AGB 2012? I do not think it is clear enough in the notes.

kavouss Arasteh:tk

Greg Shatan:@Cheryl, I would note that is not the first accusation made in this chat.

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):Switching to the Adobe App while I'm in transit to the office and then will have to drop b/c conflicting meeting. Will read transcript to catch up on any substantive discussion that I miss.

kavouss Arasteh:I am respecting everybody but just raising

questions that is all

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):bye all have to drop early

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):I will have to leave on the hour as well.

Susan Payne:me too I'm afraid

Steve Chan:We are on slide 10

kavouss Arasteh:I am not clear but I do not speak as it would be misinterpreted

Kurt Pritz:If we change nothing in the Guidebook, there are no brand TLDs and no restrictions on closed generics - there is no consensus policies on these

Greg Shatan:@Kurt, why would keeping the status quo AGB result in changes in implementation?

Greg Shatan:We can add those to consensus policy, but the lack of consensus policy doesn't roll back implementation.

Heather Forrest:Apologies, all - I need to drop off now but will follow up with the recording for the remainder.

Greg Shatan:Must drop as well.

Kurt Pritz:@ Greg: Are you advocating that the GB remain silent on Brands and closed generics but conducting the round in the same way?

Kurt Pritz:I agree with Martin - the next round must encourage innovation by developing a flexible approach to accommodating new models

Marc Palau:I need to leave, see you next time.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr:Bye Marc, thanks for joining us

Kurt Pritz:I think categorization is rigid and exclusionary (is that a word)

Martin Sutton:Good point Donna - I agree that innovation should not be stifled through categorisation where it is not needed

Christopher Wilkinson:@AGB It is already clear that the definition of Geo-Names and associated decision making policies will have to evolve.CW

kavouss Arasteh:Dear CO-chair, I raised two time the problem of process of decision making in GEO GROUP.

Steve Chan:As Cheryl is noting, this slide is in reference to the preliminary types identified on slide (12)

kavouss Arasteh:i wish to humbly reuest that the issue be seriously examined

Annebeth Lange,WT5:By having a WT5 specifically on geonames at least gives us an opportunity to consentrate on these names. Before WT5 they were drowning in WT2 and WT3.

kavouss Arasteh:I am referring to decision making process in Geo Names

kavouss Arasteh:Is there any hope that such concerns be addressed?

Donna Austin, Neustar:@Kavouss, it would be great if you could

give the process a chance.

Robin Gross:4 seems to lump two different groups together. Highly regulated industries have nothing to do with words that others may be "sensitive" to hearing.

Annebeth Lange,WT5:The problem, Kavouss, as I see it, is that GNSO, according to the bylaws of ICANN. is responsible for the new gTLD policy. So how to have a "true" cross community PDP, I am not sure how we can achieve this under the present bylaws. However, we should try to trust the process and see what can be achieved.

Steve Chan:@Robin, I believe that lumping together carries from GAC Advice. That of course would not prevent this WG from decoupling the two types.

Robin Gross:Thanks, Steve. I think we wouldn't want to lump them together.

Donna Austin, Neustar:@Annebeth, WT5 is a pro-active attempt to have a true cross community PDP and it is truly appreciated that the SO/ACs have responded positively to the request to participate.

Kurt Pritz:With regards to status quo and Cheryl's mantra that if we don't arrive at a consensus for change, we are left to the status quo: we don't have a policy on brands and closed generics and they are not in the Guidebook. It is not that I am against Brand TLDs, it is that I think the accommodations provided brands could also be afforded that don't own trademarks but that deserve and need them for their business model. This should be discussed as a consensus policy

Annebeth Lange,WT5:*Donna, I agree. However, even if that is what is the intention, still many do not feel that it is a "true" CCWG. I trust the process, but there is still a feeling of "someone matters more than others" out there, unfortunately.

Donna Austin, Neustar:@Annebeth, appreciate your thoughts and hopefully we can work together to dispell the myths.

Christa Taylor:One consideration mentioned from WT1 is Applicant Support and perhaps the prioritization of these types of applications and the implications on string contention. i.e. auctions

Annebeth Lange,WT5:@Donna, I hope so too :-)

Steve Chan:Right Cheryl, we are on slide 17

Annebeth Lange,WT5:I have to leave, bye all!

Justine Chew:thank you for the work done in summarizing issues and framing the homework

kavouss Arasteh:Dear Co- Chair , I RAISED SEVERAL QUESTION FOR WHICH i EXPECT ANSWER

Vanda Scartezini:thanks you , good one. kisses to all . I need to go to another meeting. nice day / night to everyone. KISSES

Christa Taylor:Thank-you!
Hadia Elminiawi:Thank you all
Krishna Seeburn - Kris:cheers
Vanda Scartezini:SAFE TRIPS TO ONES GOING TO IGF!!!
Robin Gross:Thanks, Cheryl and all. Bye!
Phil Buckingham:thanks Cheryl
Hadia Elminiawi:bye
Katrin Ohlmer | DOTZON:bye, all!
Dietmar Lenden - Valideus Ltd:Bye all
Dietmar Lenden - Valideus Ltd:Merry Xmas
kavouss Arasteh:The decision making process in geo name needs
to be carefully examined
Dietmar Lenden - Valideus Ltd:or Happy Holidays
Karen Day:Good bye all!
Cheryl Langdon-Orr:Bye
avri doria:bye all
Harold Arcos:Bye all, thanks