Attendance: (33 Members)

Alberto Soto
Alexander Schubert
Anne Aikman-Scalese
Annebeth Lange
Cheryl Langdon-Orr
Christopher Niemi
Christopher Wilkinson
Gemma Keegan
Gg Levine
Hadia Elminiawi
Heath Dixon
Jamie Baxter
Jason Schaeffer
Jeff Neuman
Jessica Hooper
Jim Prendergast
Jose Alberto Barrueto Rodriguez

Justine Chew
Karen Bernstein
Kavouss Arasteh
Kristina Rosette
Kristine Dorrain
Liz Brodzinski
Matthew Crossman
Maxim Alzoba
Michael Casadevall
Peter LaMantia
Phil Buckingham
Roger Carney
Sara Bockey
Sophie Hey
Susan Payne
Tom Dale

Apologies:
Vanda Scartezini
Katrin Ohlmer

Staff:
Steve Chan
Julie Hedlund
Emily Barabas
Berry Cobb
Trang Nguyen
Michelle DeSmyter

AC chat:

Michelle DeSmyter:Dear all, welcome to the New gTLD Subsequent Procedures Working Group call on Monday, 26 November 2018 at 20:00 UTC.

Michelle DeSmyter:Agenda wiki page: https://community.icann.org/x/uBm8BQ

Michelle DeSmyter:https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__docs.google.com_document_d_1sl4V7OkGldX-2DRlGZZO108ln5sUG-2DH-2DVOhz3Od2gfcRM_edit-

23&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwll3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6
TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe_5iHWGlBLwwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=fO61_l2WgFnDEry
T70Fgn7NK5k0BQiyW2gf2qVg6Cbw&s=HB8hGf4Wf8oQfmNc8B7zr63LcvNeFHHSZkpxjUx
mLUU&e=

Annebeth Lange, WT5:Hi Michelle, I managed to get away, so I am here after all

 Alexander.berlin:Some people seem to be very unmuted...

 Michelle DeSmyter:Fantastic, thank you Annebeth! I am noting this now ;)

 Kavouss Arasteh:Hi everybody

 Kavouss Arasteh:Hi Tom

 Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Hi All

 Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):PLease do mute your lines if not speaking

 Maxim Alzoba:Hello All

 Maxim Alzoba:I have an update to my SOI, I am not in GNSO SCC anymore.

 Michael Casadevall:Actually I have a SOI update as well

 Michael Casadevall:I'm a member of of NCUC/NCSG now.

 Julie Hedlund:Noted Maxim and Michael!

 Anne Aikman-Scalese:AOB - I think Jim P. had a question re the time for interviewing an auction provider

 Emily Barabas:The GNSO SSC is the Standing Selection Committee for those unfamiliar with the acronym

 Jim Prendergast:Jeff circulated what he sent to the provders middle of last week.

 José Alberto Barrueto Rodríguez:Hello all

 Anne Aikman-Scalese:Yes - Jim and he said one of them had responded and was willing to talk with us.

 Steve Chan:@Anne, the co-chairs are looking to connect with the provider and then shortly thereafter, intend to have the provider join a WG call in the future.

 Anne Aikman-Scalese:Thanks Steve and Cheryl

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Of course APAC engagement in things and times of calls are a chicken and egg issue as well ;-)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Jeff is promoting *his* SG ;-) but we can all do with greater engagement :-)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Do remember this Issues for Full WG is a 'living document' and still in draft

Phil Buckingham:As in enhanced Competition , consumer choice , consumer trust Jeff ?

Anne Aikman-Scalese:QUSETION"   Would the number of registrations in each domain be considered an indicator of success? how do we sort out those which are merely defensive? QUESTION

Gg Levine (NABP):Lack of abuse is a factor of success.

Maxim Alzoba:it is one of the ideas

Jim Prendergast:The Marketplace Health Index has been trying to tackle this topic for 2 years now. https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__www.icann.org_news_announcement-2D2018-2D06-2D20-2Den&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwll3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe_5iHWGlBLwwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=fO61_l2WgFnDEryT70Fgn7NK5k0BQiyW2gf2qVg6Cbw&s=guu2xrGUR6kjYNiUD7xi7150KhS1OZLPPZ6V1zmfQ80&e=

Maxim Alzoba:Registries are not granted hardware, software and slalries for free on public behalf

Phil Buckingham:no , not at all , Jeff.. The list is endless . What about the Global South - total lack of applications . What about IDN applications that were given priority . a success ? data metrics indicate otherwise .

Jim Prendergast:@Gg - lack of abuse? I think there have been some studies showing that SOME new gTLDs are hot beds for abuse but thats not the case across the board.

Gg Levine (NABP):@Jim: True. It would not apply to all new gTLDs; I suggest it is a measure of those that are doing well.

Anne Aikman-Scalese:`COMMENT: Re Data: I think it would be helpful to know what percentage of new registrations post content versus those which merely redirect to .com or some other home page. COMMENT

Kristine Dorrain:As Jim pointed out, the Marketplace Health Indictors and the CCT both struggled to define "success" and "benefit to the public." "Metrics" is extremely open-ended and everyone wants some.

Jim Prendergast:do we have a "small l" liasion from either ALAC or CCT-RT on this point?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Indeed they did @Kristine and @Jim and even previous discussions pre CCT-RT discussions met challenges in 'hard data aquistition'

Kristine Dorrain:I think it's a fair point to say there are a lot of initiatives to gather metrics within ICANN right now...do we need to do something different/separate here? (rhetorical question ...I say NO)

Maxim Alzoba:unification of initiatives of this sort?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):that could be SMART (pun intended @Maxim

Jim Prendergast:For the Marketplace Health Index, ICANN has recently engaged Matthew Zook from ZookNIC to try and develop more data for the reports. https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=http-3A__www.zooknic.com_&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwll3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe_5iHWGlBLwwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=fO61_l2WgFnDEryT70Fgn7NK5k0BQiyW2gf2qVg6Cbw&s=9JHwr4XJWAys-zPC9uYnSlc2AHiN6g7CxoUW2bUXqbc&e=

JOSÉ ALBERTO BARRUETO RODRÍGUEZ:The idea of unifying mechanisms of obtaining the metrics, adapted to each case, should be considered.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Thanks for that update @Jim I was not aware of that...

Phil Buckingham:FYI I am a member of the gTLD marketplace Advisory Panel . Yes there is a total lack of key data metrics that ICANN org doesnt have . They need to obtain this data from TP sources to follow up the 28 metrics we have put together.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Noted @Phil

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):We are note hearing you @Heath

Michael Casadevall:I can hear you

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Yes Jeff

Kristine Dorrain:I can hear you Jeff, but not Heath.

Michelle DeSmyter:Heath, please let me know if you need a dial out from the operator

Heath Dixon (Amazon):Sorry, not sure what the problem is with my microphone.

Michael Casadevall:If any of the gTLDs publish zone files, I can probably write some tools to help determine that.

Christopher Wilkinson:@Anne +1

Maxim Alzoba:all new gTLDs publish zone files via CZDS

Phil Buckingham:Thanks Cheryl . Would the WG like me to arrange for Matthew Zook to talk with the full WG or indeed Mukesh on behalf of ICANN. org

Trang Nguyen:As an fyi to inform this discussion, ICANN commissioned a registrant/end-user survey for the CCT RT. https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=http-3A__newgtlds.icann.org_en_reviews_cct_phase2-2Dglobal-2Dconsumer-2Dsurvey-2D23jun16-2Den.pdf&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwll3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe_5iHWGlBLwwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=fO61_l2WgFnDEryT70Fgn7NK5k0BQiyW2gf2qVg6Cbw&s=OCKSPxBIrGWBVd8LUf4L6YSgI_bbJ6trj1BIEfIHm1E&e=

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):Didn't CCT RT Final Report call for the data Ann is suggesting?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Thanks @Trang

Michael Casadevall:Would it be useful to have a tool that can go through those zone files and see if there's data there or if we're getting 302 redirects or just CNAMEs?

Susan Payne:That could be of interest, but I don't think having an active website vs a redirect necessarily denotes innovation

Michael Casadevall:Susan: well, it's a starting point :)

Michael Casadevall:Basically, determining if we're just redirecting or if there's something actually there (either CNAME record, or 30x HTTP response)

Christopher Wilkinson:We are not looking for 'SUCESS' as such. We are looking for facts about the industry.

Maxim Alzoba:I think it gives Registrants more freedom to choose

Trang Nguyen:To Jeff's comment about the parking survey, it is here: https://community.icann.org/download/attachments/56135378/ICANN%20Parking%20Check.xlsx?version=1&modificationDate=1488820496000&api=v2

Anne Aikman-Scalese:@sUSAN - A redirect is definitely not a sign of innovation.

Trang Nguyen:There is also the Pearson Linear Correlation Analysis of Parking and Renewal
Rates: https://community.icann.org/download/attachments/56135378/ParkingRenewalCorrelationAnalysisV2.docx?version=1&modificationDate=1502870290000&api=v2

Justine Chew:@Maxim: Or forces registrants to undertake defensive registrations.

Anne Aikman-Scalese:Michael C - that sounds like a good idea.

Maxim Alzoba:@Justine, it is still freedom of choice

Justine Chew:@Maxim, we hope.

Susan Payne:I think a measure of success could be the development of different business models, ie not all TLDs targetting the volume sale of names. So, TLDs which have applied eligibility restrictions to develop a communioty or other space; TLDs which are .brands, and so on

Heath Dixon (Amazon):COMMENT: We have concerns with this PDP WG trying to come up with these metrics. There are a number of other places where this work is already being done (e.g., Jim has provided good examples).

Michael Casadevall:Maxim: can you contact me with what exactly is required to get those zone files?

Michael Casadevall:Anne: I can put a proposal together to do this.

Maxim Alzoba:Michael, some zone files are quite large

Michael Casadevall:Maxim: I don't plan this to run in five minutes, I want to walk the entire zone and send HTTP requests if it's a redirect, then run it on a VPS. I may ask for a small budget for EC2 time for it.

Phil Buckingham:@ Michael C . There are players that have already done this !!! TLDs wouldnt let you get to their zone files to get to the sub level of data that we need to deter ine the key metrics that deter success or otherwise

Michael Casadevall:Phil: if a domain has open second level registeration and there's nothing there, that doesn't really say much about innotation

Christopher Wilkinson:I observed several years ago that Resellers should be contracted parties

Maxim Alzoba:I hear Jeff from time to time

Alexander.berlin backup:To add to my comment: I do NOT "condone" bulk buying of generic terms to "drive traffic" to ONE site. E.G. "injurylawyer.nyc, accidentlawyer.nyc etc" all redirtecting to ONE lawyer! That's kind of "private traffic monetization"....

Phil Buckingham:@ Michael dont start me on innovation . This is another key measure of success or otherwise . How do we measure this ? Another problem is the zone file are incomplete . There is no requirement for TLD Registries to maintaincertain zone file data. So impossible to measure statistically.

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):Thanks for the clarification. Correct, I think it's beyond the scope here.

Kavouss Arasteh:Jeff, Where resellers were referred to in the cintracted house of ICANN?

Michael Casadevall:@Phil: Well, it's a starting point to say the least. If the zone data on CZSG is out of date, that's sign of bad health in the ecosystem, no?

Steve Chan:@Jeff, we have the CCT-RT report available to display

Trang Nguyen:I believe reseller is now a required field in the WHOIS output?

Steve Chan:If you want further context (i.e., rationale/related findings)

Michael Casadevall:*CDZS

Kristine Dorrain:How do you define a reseller? I have a domain name I want to sell you...am I a reseller? What if I sell you five? A hundred? Must I have a business license from somewhere to be a reseller?

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):@Trang: Not under Spec. 5 of the nTLD Registry Agreement.

Christopher Wilkinson:On confidentiality, there are well established techniques for publishing relevant data. The drawaback is that in markets dominated bya monopoly operaotros and or concentrated sectors. But we woldn't want that outcome in the DNS, would we?

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):And to avoid even further headaches, let's assume the reseller is not a natural person to whom GDPR protections attach. :-)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Indeed!

Justine Chew:Monitor and compare levels and types of complaints

Trang Nguyen:@Kristina, thanks! I see that reseller is an optional field.

Anne Aikman-Scalese:This language should be clarified to state that ICANN org could "suggest to the IRT"

Kavouss Arasteh:Kristina, what is the basis of that assption

Trang Nguyen:@Jeff, that's correct.

Kavouss Arasteh:Asumptionp

Phil Buckingham:Totally in agreement Kristina. There is absolutely no point in drilling down to the reseller level . It would be near impossible to get accurate data to then publish with any degree of confidence .

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):Had to drop from audio for another call.

Steve Chan:Program Implementation Review Report (PIRR)

Alberto Soto:Sorry, I could not get in before...

Steve Chan:Also, the public comments ICANN org made seek to identify gaps as well

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Adobe is being flakey today for Jeff Sorry People

Maxim Alzoba:Resellers might be companies and persons

Kavouss Arasteh:Yes if they are companies ,they would beare aassumed to be legal pertson unles they have not delegate the responsibility to a naural person

Kavouss Arasteh:I have to drop for another session

Anne Aikman-Scalese:COMMENT: A lot of issues arose in the 2012 round after the application window closed. That is one reason we need a standing IRT. ICANN.org should make its suggestions to the IRT. COMMENT

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-Chair):Sorry about my Adobe. I have no idea why my Adobe is minutes behind everyone else....

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Yes @Jamie we hear those concerns

Phil Buckingham:I totally agree , Anne. What would be the composition of this IRT

Steve Chan:FYI, the ICANN org comments here were actually a single commment, but (policy) staff thought it helpful to parse out the separate themes for easier understanding.

Anne Aikman-Scalese:GNSO Operating Procedures specify how IRTs should be constituted. There is a Consensus Policy Implementation Framework that deals with

this. Broad community respresentation is needed on the IRT and IRT has to determine when and if new issues should be brought before the GNSO. In addition, any GNSO member can invoke a process to make an issue the subject of deliberation in relation to whether furher policy work is needed or not.

Justine Chew:I can't help but think whether this feedback goes to the way the WT5 Report is being set out re: what exactly is staying and what is changing

  Jamie Baxter | dotgay:I would like to know the answer to Anne's question as well.

  Maxim Alzoba:also - it is important who is going to interpret AGB

  Maxim Alzoba:the same answer

  Michael Casadevall:Just add an action item to follow up with my work on health status stuff

  Michael Casadevall:for next meeting

  Phil Buckingham:Thanks Trang. Will the AGB have a complete rewrite , with new modules and sub sections ?

  Jamie Baxter | dotgay:Thanks for the clarification Trang

  Trang Nguyen:@Phil, the extent of the re-write will depend on the changes that the PDP WG is recommendating. There are some recommendations for re-structuring of the AGB as well so we'll look into how to implement those recommendations.

  Phil Buckingham:@ Trang . Thanks

  Jim Prendergast:come join the sub groups - thats where the real fun is!!!

  Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Indeed @Jim

  Emily Barabas:Next call is Dec 18 at 3 UTC

  Maxim Alzoba:bye all

  Annebeth Lange, WT5:Thanks, interesting discussion. Good bye!

  Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Thanks all... Bye for now