LIU Yue’s comments for the proposal

The issue of Transition NTIA’s Stewardship of IANA functions is significant for the development and the security of the Internet. I want to start by thanking ICANN for convening this issue and making a lot of efforts. In order to promote the transition, it is necessary to ensure that all the stakeholders can express their points and involve in the process.

In regard to the Steering Group proposed by ICANN, I have the following comments:

First, it is absolutely essential to establish a Steering Group to steward the process. Moreover, the work of the Steering Group should be open and transparency, which is an important precondition to ensure that the transition proposal can be formulated smoothly.

Second, given the importance of the transition of IANA function stewardship and the establishment of the Steering Group, the time calling for public inputs should be extended. It is expected to extend the deadline from May 8 to May 31 at least, so that all the stakeholders have more enough time to fully study the draft and provide constructive suggestion.

Third, the proposed composition of the Steering Group is lack of in-depth consideration and reasonable principles, which is not a good structure for the all the stakeholders to fully express views. The Steering Group should fully consider the sizes and characteristics of all kinds of communities. The proposed structure of Steering Group should be revised.

I have the following advices on how to establish the Steering Group:
Governments (not limited to GAC members), users, ccTLD operators and gTLD operators are the most directly affected stakeholders by DNS. The representatives of those stakeholders should be increased, at least no less than five representatives for each stakeholder group (considering geographic balance). In order to fully take into account the protection of the public interests, government on behalf of the public interests, can even have more positions (such as two representatives from each region). Meanwhile, as for representatives of governments, in order to promote the participation of developing countries and to protect the public interests of developing countries, it should take into account not only the geographical balance, but also the percentage of developing countries (no less than 50%). Representatives of governments would be recommended by GAC (The invitation letter relating to involvement in the selection of the representatives of governments should be sent to all countries and regions, but not limited to GAC members). The representatives of ccTLD operators and gTLD operators would be respectively recommended by the ccNSO and GNSO. Representatives of users would be recommended by ALAC.

The representatives of the technical community should participate in the discussion of transition proposal and evaluate the proposal from technical perspective, to ensure that the proposal will not affect the security and stability of the Internet. Each technical community selects a representative, including SSAC, RSSAC, IAB, IETF, ISOC, RIRs and ASO.

Steering Group should work with a consensus-driven approach, that is to say, each representative should seek consensus within his/her own
community. Additionally, ICANN Board should nominate a liaison person as a coordinator to be involved in the Steering Group. The liaison person should report the progress of this issue to ICANN board and get the feedback from ICANN board for Steering Group.

According to the revised Steering Group, the proposed process to formulate the proposal of Transition NTIA’s Stewardship of IANA functions is as follows:

First step: Steering Group broadly calls for inputs from all communities. The draft proposal is prepared by the Secretariat under the guidance of the Steering Group.

Second step: Steering Group discusses the draft proposal, and make suggestions for revision. Particularly those representatives of governments and users should make comments on behalf of the public interests;

Third step: Steering Group publishes the draft proposal, calls for feedbacks, and revises the proposal according to feedbacks (many rounds).

Fourth step: Steering Group seeks advice from the technical community and reaches consensus with technical community, in order to ensure that program implementation process will not affect the safe and stable operation of the Internet;

Fifth step: based on the consensus of Steering Group, the draft proposal will be delivered to and endorsed by ICANN board.

Sixth step: ICANN board delivers the draft proposal to NTIA and gets the formal endorsement.
Figure: the revised structure of Steering Group

LIU, Yue
Scholar
Institute of Governance Research