

RSSAC Meeting Minutes

6 November 2019 | 14:00-15:15 UTC

Attendance

Cogent

DISA Kevin Wright, Ryan Stephenson

ICANN Matt Larson

ISC Fred Baker, Jeff Osborn

NASA Tom Miglin

Netnod

RIPE NCC Kaveh Ranjbar

UMD Karl Reuss

USC ISI Wes Hardaker

US ARL Ken Renard

Verisign Brad Verd

WIDE Hiro Hotta

Liaison to the Board Kaveh Ranjbar

Liaison to the CSC

Liaison to the RZERC Brad Verd

Liaison from the SSAC Russ Mundy

Liaison from the IAB Daniel Migault

Liaison from the IANA Functions Operator Naela Sarras

Liaison from the Root Zone Maintainer Duane Wessels

Staff Andrew McConachie, Carlos Reyes, and Ozan Sahin.

Action Items from this Meeting:

- Staff to publish the minutes from 3 October 2019 teleconference.
- Staff to send published minutes from 3 October 2019 teleconference to the RSSAC Caucus mailing list.
- Staff to follow up with Paul Hoffman on a document explaining the purpose of the resolver testing software platform and share with the RSSAC once ICANN Legal sign-off on the license has been received.
- Andrew McConachie and Danielle Rutherford to update RSSAC002v3, RSSAC023, and RSSAC026 based on the feedback received.
- RSSAC Statement on Threat Mitigation for the Root Server System to be shared for review and edits for a potential vote during December teleconference.
- Staff to send a note to RSSAC Caucus list to collect feedback on the Proposal for Future KSK Rollovers document.

Call to Order

Brad Verd called the meeting to order at 14:00 UTC.

Roll Call

Brad Verd conducted a roll call. Quorum was present to conduct the meeting and to take formal action, if necessary.

Agenda Review

Fred Baker reviewed the agenda and there was no objection or requested additions.

Administration

Approval of Minutes

The RSSAC approved the draft minutes from the 3 October 2019 teleconference. Motion by Wes Hardaker and second by Ryan Stephenson.

ACTION ITEM: Staff to publish the minutes from 3 October 2019 teleconference.

ACTION ITEM: Staff to send published minutes from 3 October 2019 teleconference to the RSSAC Caucus mailing list.

ICANN67 Travel Support Deadline

Ozan Sahin reminded RSSAC members that the deadline to request travel support for ICANN67 was Wednesday, 6 November. Ozan explained that there would be travel support available for the Chair, Vice Chair, and four RSSAC members.

Vice Chair Election Timeline

Ozan Sahin provided an update on the Vice Chair election timeline. Ozan noted that the nomination period started on Friday, 25 October and would remain open for a month. Ozan added that no nominations had been received by the time of the November RSSAC meeting.

Work Items

RSS Metrics Work Party Update

Duane Wessels reported that the work party was getting close to the state of having a final draft for the RSSAC Caucus to review.

Modern Resolver Behavior Work Party Update

Paul Hoffman reported that the work party was almost done with the main work, which was to create a software platform to look at resolver behavior. Paul noted that he was awaiting ICANN legal review regarding the license. Paul committed to write up a document upon the completion of the legal review on the license and share the document with the RSSAC.

ACTION ITEM: Staff to follow up with Paul Hoffman on a document explaining the purpose of the resolver testing software platform and share with the RSSAC once ICANN Legal sign-off on the license has been received.

For planning purposes, Carlos Reyes asked Paul Hoffman whether there would be any documents that RSSAC would need to vote on as part of the output of the work party. Paul Hoffman replied that this point was not discussed at the work party. Paul added that it would be up for the RSSAC to decide whether to vote on the document he would be preparing and turn it into an RSSAC document. Wes Hardaker commented that he thought there would be a separate report in the long run which would discuss the results of the tests. Paul Hoffman agreed with this thought. Paul concluded that he envisioned a short document summarizing the progress of the work party in the first place and a second technical document with the test results.

RSSAC002, RSSAC023, RSSAC026 Updates

Andrew McConachie acknowledged the good feedback received earlier in the week during the work sessions to update the documents in concern. In terms of the next steps Andrew committed to update the documents with Danielle Rutherford in light of the feedback received and schedule calls to discuss them further.

ACTION ITEM: Andrew McConachie and Danielle Rutherford to update RSSAC002v3, RSSAC023, and RSSAC026 based on the feedback received.

Brad Verd encouraged RSO representatives to share their updates to RSSAC023 for their individual identifiers with staff if they had any.

Reports

Co-Chairs

Brad Verd reported that Fred Baker and he had a call with Göran Marby since the last RSSAC teleconference, during which they ran through the questions to the ICANN Board, the RSO

Independence documents, and an RSSAC statement on the Threat Mitigation of the Root Server System document.

Brad continued that Fred and he had a sit down with Cherine Chalaby and Maarten Botterman at ICANN66 during which the RSSAC Co-Chairs were assured that there would be continuity from Cherine to Maarten in terms of their approach to RSSAC037 and RSSAC038. Brad noted that Fred and he asked Cherine and Maarten whether they thought about the SLAs, the question which was removed from the list of questions to the ICANN Board later on. The short answer to this question was “no”.

Fred Baker mentioned a meeting Brad and he had with David Conrad during ICANN66. Fred told the same question was brought up and David Conrad and David’s comments, in the beginning of the conversation, focused on an SLA with the RSS, not individual RSOs.

Brad and Fred also pointed out that a meeting of SO/AC leadership in January was scheduled to talk through prioritization for the community.

In addition, Brad reported that Fred and he had a meeting with Brian Cute who had been tasked with moderating the discussions around the “Evolution of the Multistakeholder Model”.

Lastly, Fred told the RSSAC that he met the ICANN org CFO Xavier Calvez. Fred reported that the quick conversation was about the funding related to RSSAC037 and Xavier was planning to have some related meetings in Los Angeles. Fred added that Xavier would need some input from the RSSAC on this matter.

ICANN Board

Kaveh Ranjbar reported that the resolution asking the ICANN Board to form the Governance Working Group (GWG) would be approved the following day. Regarding the question from the Board to the SOs and ACs for their meeting with the Board [ICANN’s readiness to implement the three plans: (1) Strategic Plan FY21-25, (2) Operating & Financial Plan FY 21-25, (3) Work Plan to improve the effectiveness of ICANN’s multistakeholder model], Kaveh echoed the ICANN Board’s expectation of the RSSAC to participate in this discussion.

Brad Verd commented that if the RSSAC wanted to be part of the Empowered Community then he would agree with the Board in that the RSSAC needed to be more involved in such discussions.

Wes Hardaker asked Kaveh whether there was a list being formed of the ways in which RSSAC could be more involved. Kaveh responded that there was not any push but an obvious expectation from the ICANN Board. Fred Baker added that the expectation was not new and came up in the RSSAC review as well. Brad Verd gave the example that if there was a

conversation about prioritization which the RSSAC would not participate then RSSAC would get deprioritized.

RZERC

Brad Verd mentioned that the RZERC would have its annual meeting later that day and he would report on that meeting at the next RSSAC teleconference.

SSAC

Russ Mundy noted that the RSSAC and the SSAC had a successful joint meeting the day before and some follow up actions were ongoing. Kaveh Ranjbar said he could not join the RSSAC & SSAC joint meeting due to a conflict and asked whether the SSAC's Scan of Threats document was shared during the meeting. Brad Verd replied that there was a short discussion on the document but the document itself was not shared with the RSSAC.

IAB

Daniel Migault reported that the IAB was considering the names for the two seats it had in RSS Governance Working Group (GWG).

IANA Functions Operator

Naela Sarras had no update.

Root Zone Maintainer

Duane Wessels had no update.

Second Security, Stability, and Resiliency Review (SSR2)

Eric Osterweil was not in the meeting. Rao Naveed Bin Rais, also on the SSR2 Team, agreed to share a quick update. Naveed noted that the review team was in the phase of drafting final recommendations with the target of publishing the draft recommendations for public comment early 2020.

Nominating Committee

Amir Qayyum reported that NomCom 2020 had its initial meetings on 2 and 3 November. Amir provided a list of the seven leadership positions that NomCom 2020 would be tasked to make selections for. Amir pointed out the application deadline which had been pulled back to mid-February in 2020.

Carlos Reyes asked whether there were regional restrictions on Board seats based on the bylaw requirements. Amir replied that there was not such a requirement. However, he added that it was strongly recommended by the Board Governance Committee (BGC) to select at least one Board member from Europe region.

Fellowship Selection Committee

Amir Qayyum pointed out the recommendations for the fellowship selections formulated by the Outreach and Engagement Working Group of Workstream 2 Diversity Subgroup which invited SOs and ACs to provide targets for diversity categories. Amir reported that only At-Large community provided suggested targets. Amir invited RSSAC to provide suggested targets if it wanted to do so and noted that he did not believe this input was utilized effectively during the selection process as the selection committee has just finalized the selection process for ICANN67 to be held in Cancun, Mexico.

Fellowship Mentoring Committee

Rao Naveed Bin Rais described the mentoring process to the RSSAC. Naveed told that there were five mentors from SOs and ACs who were assigned six to eight fellowship mentees. Naveed noted that he invited his mentees to attend the RSSAC Caucus meeting at ICANN66 and a few of them were able to join the meeting. Naveed added that it was unfortunate to see only two of his mentees in Canada as nine out of the eleven mentees he was assigned got rejections for their visa applications.

Any Other Business

Brad Verd brought up the fact that RSSAC had been asked by the Board Technical Committee (BTC) to endorse the "Threat Mitigation for the RSS" document published by the Root Server Operators (RSOs). Brad noted that Andrew McConachie drafted a paper to endorse the document published by the RSOs. Paul Hoffman asked whether the endorsement language would include the RSO publication itself or have a link to the publication. Brad replied that the RSSAC document would not include the Threat Mitigation document but have a link to it in the footnote section. Matt Larson commented that publishing this endorsement to the Threat Mitigation document would make sense and complete the circle.

Andrew added that the second footnote on the document was a link to the actual Threat Mitigation for the RSS document whereas the first footnote was a link to the transcript of the RSSAC & ICANN Board joint meeting at ICANN61. Wes Hardaker noted that this related to ICANN Board's transparency of doing everything with the information that was directly handed to them and not considering stuff that they did not get from the community. As a result, Wes commented that RSSAC had to endorse the document. Russ Mundy noted that it would be well received by the SSAC if RSSAC endorsed the document root server operators had published. Brad Verd summarized that based on the discussions RSSAC had to go ahead and go through the normal process of publishing a document.

ACTION ITEM: RSSAC Statement on Threat Mitigation for the Root Server System to be shared for review and edits for a potential vote during December teleconference.

Brad Verd shared with the RSSAC that IANA had published a document called "Proposal for Future KSK Rollovers" for public comment. Brad asked whether RSSAC needed to comment on this document. He reminded the group that during the joint meeting with the SSAC the day before it was suggested that RSSAC and SSAC could do a joint statement. Brad also pointed out the deadline to submit a comment for this document which was 31 January 2020. The RSSAC discussed whether to collect feedback on the RSSAC mailing list or RSSAC Caucus mailing list. Naela Sarras mentioned that Kim Davies would be presenting this document later in the day in the DNSSEC workshop and any RSSAC members were welcome to attend the session.

ACTION ITEM: Staff to send a note to RSSAC Caucus list to collect feedback on the document.

Brad Verd reminded the RSSAC that the next RSSAC teleconference would take place on Tuesday, 3 December.

Adjournment

The RSSAC concluded the meeting without objections.