

**Attendance: (11 Members)**

Crystal Ondo  
David Maher  
Gary Campbell  
George Kirikos  
Jay Chapman  
Osvaldo Novoa  
Paul Tattersfield  
Petter Rindforth  
Philip Corwin  
Reg Levy  
Susan Kawaguchi

Apologies:  
Zak Muskovitch

Staff:  
Mary Wong  
Steve Chan  
Berry Cobb  
Dennis Chang  
Michelle DeSmyter

**WebEx chat:**

from Osvaldo Novoa to All Participants:Hello all

from George Kirikos to All Participants:Hi folks.

from Steven Chan to All Participants:Hi George, your hand is still up, unless that's a new hand!

from George Kirikos to All Participants:Sorry about that.

from Gary Campbell to All Participants:Hi all

from George Kirikos to All Participants:Are we sticking to the 2 minute rule for today's call?

from Susan Kawaguchi to All Participants:we should try and allow everyone to speak

from Jay Chapman to All Participants:sorry to be late - trouble loggin in

from David Maher to All Participants:I prefer the original wording, but would support Petter's addition.

from George Kirikos to All Participants:We can add those words to the 2nd column's change, sure.

from George Kirikos to All Participants:+1

from George Kirikos to All Participants:I'd find that agreeable, going back to the original UDRP/URS text for precision.

from George Kirikos to All Participants:Otherwise, another group will need to be convened to reconsider that question from scratch.

from George Kirikos to All Participants:

On principle, I agree with Reg, no one should be getting subsidized.

from George Kirikos to All Participants:But, willing to trade this off, if it can mean full consensus on the next recommendation.

from George Kirikos to All Participants:(new hand)

from Philip Corwin to All Participants:My hand is up

from Steven Chan to All Participants:Petter, you have Phil, Susan, and then George in the queue

from Osvaldo Novoa to All Participants:I do support subsidies in costs

from Osvaldo Novoa to All Participants:I am OK with Phil's proposal

from Philip Corwin to All Participants:I can draft up a modification and post to the list after the call

from David Maher to All Participants:I believe the GAC advice is sufficient justification

from George Kirikos to All Participants:@David: but, then why have a PDP itself, if GAC advice trumps everything?

from Philip Corwin to All Participants:The Charter does require us to consider "The need to address the issue of cost to IGOs and INGOs to use curative processes" [https://gnso.icann.org/sites/default/files/filefield\\_45569/igo-ingo-crp-access-charter-24jun14-en.pdf](https://gnso.icann.org/sites/default/files/filefield_45569/igo-ingo-crp-access-charter-24jun14-en.pdf)

from George Kirikos to All Participants:Would PIR give IGOs free domain names, for example?

from George Kirikos to All Participants:Lots of non-profits would also want free UDRP/URS.

from George Kirikos to All Participants:Or welfare recipients, or others with lower economic resources.

from David Maher to All Participants:For a change, I agree w/ George

from David Maher to All Participants:on option 1

from George Kirikos to All Participants:If no one is in the queue, I can restart, but I'm back of the line.

from George Kirikos to All Participants:Thanks David. It's very similar to the Yoyo.email cause of action issue you wrote about on CircleID.

from George Kirikos to All Participants:I think the chair needs to make "initial designations".

from George Kirikos to All Participants:So, he would make a designation level for each of the 6 recommendations.

from George Kirikos to All Participants:And then those who disagree with those designations would speak out.

from George Kirikos to All ParticipantsDead sound.

from George Kirikos to All Participants:I'm still in the queue.

from George Kirikos to All Participants:(Phil seemed to jump ahead of me with his followup)

from Philip Corwin to All Participants:Coordination between 2 working groups is not the same as one WG telling Council to task the other WG with a new specific requirement

from Jay Chapman to All Participants:Agree with George - Zak's recommendation was a very limited

from Philip Corwin to All Participants:The RPM WG Charter does require it to consider issues of appeal from URS and UDRP, but does not specifically mention IGO or broader sovereign immunity issues

from George Kirikos to All Participants:@Phil: right, it talks about coordination with other related working groups, or words to that effect.

from George Kirikos to All Participants:(the exact language I posted on the mailing list already)

from George Kirikos to All Participants:Paul T was next.

from George Kirikos to All ParticipantsBut, did Petter just say something about voting??!!??

from George Kirikos to All Participants:(i.e. that was a last resort, if there was disagreement about the designation levels, after the process of iteration in Section 3.6 of the rules)

from Jay Chapman to All Participants:I support Paul's suggested changes in option 1

from George Kirikos to All Participants:They're in sec 3.6 of the working group guidelines.

from mary to All Participants:Exactly, susan - we will definitely list all the options, we were just trying for purposes of this call to see if either of what seemed to be the leading options might become the consensus one. But we never intended to take out the other four options

from George Kirikos to All Participants:But, they're not numerically set.

from George Kirikos to All Participants:They're qualitativeley set.

from George Kirikos to All Participants:\*qualitatively

from mary to All Participants:No numerical threshold

from mary to All Participants:Designation by chairs

from mary to All Participants:To which members can object and file minority statements

from Steven Chan to All Participants:

<https://gnso.icann.org/sites/default/files/file/field-file-attach/annex-1-gnso-wg-guidelines-30jan18-en.pdf>

from mary to All Participants:There is no reset of the clock but generally that's more or less right George

from George Kirikos to All Participants:Maybe put that PDF on screen, section 3.6?

from George Kirikos to All Participants:(new hand)

from George Kirikos to All Participants:Someone is talking in the background?

from George Kirikos to All Participants:(was)

from Philip Corwin to All Participants:Lots of background noise

from George Kirikos to All Participants:See page 9 of:  
<https://gnso.icann.org/sites/default/files/file/field-file-attach/annex-1-gnso-wg-guidelines-30jan18-en.pdf>

from George Kirikos to All Participants:I don't think Recommendation about the subsidies for IGOs has consensus, though.

from Philip Corwin to All Participants:I circulated proposed modified language on the subsidy issue a few minutes ago

from Philip Corwin to All Participants:Hand up

from Jay Chapman to All Participants:hard stop for me. thanks all

from George Kirikos to All Participants:Bye folks. Have a nice GDRP-day. :-)

from George Kirikos to All Participants:Or Han Solo Day, too! :-)

from Osvaldo Novoa to All Participants:Bye