

## Overview Metrics, Assessment and Outcome

- Metric – Brief description of objective
- Assessment - Summary of the Findings of the Review team with respect to specific Metric
- Outcome -The metric is:
  - Achieved
  - Not Achieved
  - Not Applicable (N/A)
- New Metric: Additional Metric to assess implementation of recommendations 1<sup>st</sup> Effectiveness Review.

	Metric	Assessment	Outcome
1.	CSC monitors the performance of the IANA naming function against agreed service level targets on a regular basis	PTI sends the performance report to all CSC Members monthly. The CSC produces a monthly Findings report. The previous reports can be found at: <a href="https://www.icann.org/csc">https://www.icann.org/csc</a> under section Reports & Findings. The PTI report includes references to all SLAs as listed under the IANA Naming Function Contract.	
2.	CSC analyses monthly reports provided by PTI and publishes their findings		
3.	CSC follows up where required on any performance issues identified and agrees on a plan for resolution with PTI and ICANN	The CSC discusses and follows-up if an SLA is not met and reports the result in the Findings report, see for example: PTI performance Report December 2020 ( <a href="https://www.icann.org/iana_csc_docs/519-csc-findings-of-pti-performance-december-2020-v-1">https://www.icann.org/iana_csc_docs/519-csc-findings-of-pti-performance-december-2020-v-1</a> ) and follow-up discussion pertaining to the SLA that was missed (CSC agenda and discussion February & March 2021 (see for example: <a href="https://www.icann.org/uploads/iana_work_session_asset/attachment/1029/1631302896622Agenda_and_Notes_CS_C_Meeting_47-17_February_2021.pdf">https://www.icann.org/uploads/iana_work_session_asset/attachment/1029/1631302896622Agenda_and_Notes_CS_C_Meeting_47-17_February_2021.pdf</a> ))	
4.	Where appropriate, the CSC requests a review or change of a service level agreement.	The CSC is mandated to discuss the provisioning of IANA Naming Services through the process for amending the IANA Naming Service Level Agreements ( <a href="https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/iana-naming-function-sla-amendment-process-28mar19-en.pdf">https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/iana-naming-function-sla-amendment-process-28mar19-en.pdf</a> ). After the process became effective, 3 Service Level Agreements have been changed/introduced: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Technical checks</li> <li>- Processing IDN Table (new SLA)</li> <li>- ccTLD delegation/transfer (amendment)</li> </ul> Additionally the CSC together with PTI explored the need to change an SLA in February and March 2021 (see above item # 3).	

	Metric	Assessment	Outcome
5.	Where appropriate the CSC undertakes remedial action to address poor performance in accordance with the Remedial Action Procedures	<p>The CSC are aware they are required to do this but so far in my time in the CSC this has never been required.</p> <p>No remedial action to date has been required The Procedure itself can be found at: <a href="https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/csc-remedial-action-procedures-19feb19-en.pdf">https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/csc-remedial-action-procedures-19feb19-en.pdf</a></p>	
6.	When appropriate remedial action by the CSC has not resolved the poor performance, CSC is authorised to escalate the performance issues to the ccNSO and GNSO for consideration	To date the Remedial Action Procedure has not been invoked.	
7.	CSC has an effective process for tracking complaints that have been escalated to PTI Management (Escalations), and CSC Members can be directly informed of individual complaints by email.	<p>The CSC is informed by PTI if they have received complaints and if so how it was handled. This is reported in CSC Findings of PTI Performance (see the monthly Findings Reports). According to its Charter the CSC does not handle individual complaints (see: <a href="https://www.icann.org/en/csc/complaints">https://www.icann.org/en/csc/complaints</a>).</p>	
8.	CSC will at least annually conduct a consultation with PTI and ICANN, the primary customers of the naming services and the ICANN community about the performance of PTI	<p>The CSC meets with the PTI Board and representatives of the ICANN board at least once each year to discuss PTI Performance and related matters.</p> <p>With respect to meetings with the BTC see for example agenda April 2021 <a href="https://community.icann.org/display/CSC/14+April+2021">https://community.icann.org/display/CSC/14+April+2021</a>).</p> <p>For meetings with PTI Board see for example agenda October 2020 <a href="https://www.icann.org/uploads/iana_work_session_asset/attachment/1025/1631302807621Agenda_and_Notes_CSC_Meeting_44_October_2020.pdf">https://www.icann.org/uploads/iana_work_session_asset/attachment/1025/1631302807621Agenda_and_Notes_CSC_Meeting_44_October_2020.pdf</a>)</p>	
9.	CSC, in consultation with the registry operators, is authorised to discuss with ICANN and PTI ways to enhance the provision of IANA's operational services	<p>The CSC is mandated to discuss the provisioning of IANA Naming Services through the process for amending the IANA Naming Service Level Agreements <a href="https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/iana-naming-function-sla-amendment-process-28mar19-en.pdf">https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/iana-naming-function-sla-amendment-process-28mar19-en.pdf</a>)</p> <p>According to process 3 Service Level Agreements have been changed/introduced:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Technical checks</li> <li>- Processing IDN Table (new SLA)</li> <li>- ccTLD delegation/transfer (amendment)</li> </ul>	

	Metric	Assessment	Outcome
		<p>Additionally the CSC together with PTI explored need to change the a SLA (see above item # 3) and whether there is a role if any, with respect to DSNsec KSK (for example see: item 6 agenda and notes CSC Meeting 45, <a href="https://www.icann.org/uploads/iana_work_session_asset/attachment/1027/1631302836785Agenda_and_Notes_CS_C_Meeting_45_-_18_November_2020.pdf">https://www.icann.org/uploads/iana_work_session_asset/attachment/1027/1631302836785Agenda_and_Notes_CS_C_Meeting_45_-_18_November_2020.pdf</a>)</p>	
10.	<p>Where ICANN and PTI have been responsible for implementing recommended changes to operational services or the Service Level Agreements, the CSC is confident that has been completed appropriately</p>	<p>See examples:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Technical checks</li> <li>- Processing IDN Table (new SLA)</li> <li>- ccTLD delegation/transfer (amendment)</li> </ul> <p>The conclusion of implementation of an amended SLA is integral part of the amendment process (See Amendment process, Section II, sub 5,</p>	
11.	<p>CSC is providing a liaison to the IANA Functions Review Team</p>	<p>The CSC has appointed a liaison to the first IFRT ( see: <a href="https://community.icann.org/display/ifr/Review+Team+Composition">https://community.icann.org/display/ifr/Review+Team+Composition</a> )</p>	
12.	<p>CSC is providing a liaison to a Separation Cross Community Working Group</p>	<p>To date there is has not been separation cross community working group.</p>	
13.	<p>Meeting attendance of CSC members</p>	<p>Attendance of the meetings for CSC Members is recorded here: <a href="https://community.icann.org/display/CSC/Attendance?preview=/84216784/180028098/CSC_Attendance%20Tracker%202020_2021%20JAN-%20OCT.xlsx">https://community.icann.org/display/CSC/Attendance?preview=/84216784/180028098/CSC_Attendance%20Tracker%202020_2021%20JAN-%20OCT.xlsx</a></p>	
14.	<p>Meeting attendance of CSC liaisons excluding PTI Liaison</p>	<p>Attendance of the meetings for CSC Liaisons is recorded here: <a href="https://community.icann.org/display/CSC/Attendance?preview=/84216784/180028098/CSC_Attendance%20Tracker%202020_2021%20JAN-%20OCT.xlsx">https://community.icann.org/display/CSC/Attendance?preview=/84216784/180028098/CSC_Attendance%20Tracker%202020_2021%20JAN-%20OCT.xlsx</a></p>	
15.	<p>NEW METRIC Implementation 1<sup>st</sup> Effectiveness Review Recommendations</p>	<p><b>Recommendation 1:</b> The CSC is to document and publish the procedure for how the CSC intends to deal with complaints they receive from individual PTI customers.</p> <p><b>Current status</b></p> <p>See Message on website: <a href="https://www.icann.org/en/csc/complaints">https://www.icann.org/en/csc/complaints</a></p> <p>A link to the IANA complaint process is also included on CSC website.</p> <p><b>Recommendation 2:</b> The CSC provides appointing organizations with attendance records on a regular basis,</p>	

	Metric	Assessment	Outcome
		<p>at least every year in the month May, and where minimum attendance requirements are not being met, the Chair of the CSC formally notifies the appointing organization.</p> <p><b>Current Status</b></p> <p>In order to meet the attendance record it is documented: Also noted that CSC now meets at rotational schedule ( 10.00 UTC, 18.00 UTC and 02.00 UTC). Members understand need to attend.</p> <p>Overview per meeting available:  <a href="https://community.icann.org/display/CSC/Attendance">https://community.icann.org/display/CSC/Attendance</a></p> <p><b>Recommendation 3:</b> The CSC develop an overview of the skills and expertise required on the CSC, and map the skills of current members and liaisons against the required skill set to inform the selection process of the appointing organizations.</p> <p><b>Current Status</b></p> <p>Skill overview has been produced. Appointing organizations use it in call for volunteers. Currently membership very stable.</p> <p>See skill matrix:  <a href="https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/csc-skill-set-matrix-members-liaisons-04jun19-en.pdf">https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/csc-skill-set-matrix-members-liaisons-04jun19-en.pdf</a></p> <p><b>Recommendation 4:</b> The CSC develops an induction program that new members and liaisons are required to undertake.</p> <p><b>Current Status</b></p> <p>Introduction of new members and liaisons: Subscription to email list upon appointment. On-boarding session(s) with appointee, chair, vice-chair and staff.</p> <p><b>See:</b> <a href="https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/csc-overview-members-liaisons-04jun19-en.pdf">https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/csc-overview-members-liaisons-04jun19-en.pdf</a></p>	
16.	NEW METRIC Has Issue identified 1 <sup>st</sup> Review been addressed?		